

Proceedings of Extra Ordinary Gram Sabha Meeting held on 29/06/2019 at 03.00 p.m. in V.P. Navelim Hall, under the chairmanship of Smt. Vilma D'Silva, Sarpanch, V.P. Navelim. The signatures of the members present are taken on the attendance register where in 31 members are present. Earlier this meeting is adjourned by half an hour after waiting for 15 minutes and the same started at 03.45 am.

At the outset the Sarpanch welcomed the members present and extended warm greetings and informed that this Gram Sabha is convened as per the direction of Block Development Officer, Salcete vide its Memorandum No. 1/EST/Water Conservation/BDOS/2018-19/1780 dated 01/07/2019. She further informed that the draft Coastal Plan Management Plan is received from the Block Development Officer, Margao was kept in the Panchayat office for view by the public for which a Public Notice was issued vide Ref. No.VP/N/433/2019-20 dated 07/06/2019, hence the same is also taken for discussion as per the agenda of this meeting.

1. **To place and discuss the draft Coastal Management Plan received from the Block Development Officer, Margao for objections and suggestions, if any.**

Siddharth Karapurkar	Proposer
All Gram Sabha Members	Seconder

The Sarpanch informed the Gram Sabha Members that Shri. Siddharth Karapurkar has volunteered to present the details of Coastal Management Plan via PowerPoint presentation. She called upon him to take over the meeting with detailed discussion from the Gram Sabha Members. The discussions that happened are recorded as below:-

- a) That The rivers and associated coastal áreas have been created by the indigenous communities called 'Gaonkaris' (renamed by the Portuguese rulers as 'Comunidades' about 500 years ago) and are entirely the creation of these highly developed communities. All of the rivers, bunds, water bodies, khazans, etc were created by the indigenous communities for fishing, agriculture and other economic activities, without affecting the environment. The communities grow rice in the reclaimed khazans during the monsoons and use the same lands for fish breeding and cultivation using natural and tidal processes in the rest of the year.

- b) That the entire coast of Goa, which includes all the CRZ areas, especially the rivers, khazans, water bodies, sand dunes, mudflats, mangroves, etc, belong to the indigenous communities of Goa, who have created and maintained these coastal features for centuries.
- c) That India is a signatory to the UN Declaration on Rights of Indigenous People and has committed to the International Community that no rights of the indigenous communities will be interfered with by the Government of India without first obtaining 'Free, Prior, Informed Consent' of the indigenous communities.
- d) That the CZMPs notified for Public Hearing on 07.07.2019 have been prepared by NCSCM without consulting or even informing the indigenous communities of Goa. The CZMPs prepared by NCSCM will completely destroy all the rights of the Goan indigenous communities without even consulting them, and these CZMPs are therefore completely illegal.
- e) That the rivers, bunds, sluice gates, khazans and associated water bodies of Goa were created 3,000 years ago or earlier by the gaonkaris of the local communities. The thousands of kms long bunds and engineering of the land and water to create these perfected fishing-farming-ecological systems is a unique and most remarkable heritage of the entire mankind. These rivers, bunds, sluice gates, khazans and associated water bodies of Goa must be demarcated as "Areas of archaeological importance and heritage sites" in accordance with para 7, (i), (k) of CRZ Notification 2011.
- f) The CZMPs are completely inadequate due to unavailability of essential information necessary for review and appraisal by the people and communities, such as:-
 - i. CZMPs for Goa prepared in 1996 under CRZ Notification 1991, which are in force today, have not been made available to the people, making it impossible to compare and see the benefits or losses to the people and the environment due to changes proposed by the proposed CZMPs under the CRZ Notification 2011. The CRZ Notification 2011 specifically states that a comparison with the earlier CZMPs must be provided, but none has been provided.
 - ii. None of the references, base data, analyses or other essential information is made available, making the CZMPs arbitrary and denying the people their right to examine the choices, reasoning and logic considered.

- iii. The report fails to provide any details of the primary data collection carried out by NCSCM, making it impossible to review or examine the veracity of the same. NCSCM has never come to our villages or consulted any of us, and therefore this information should have been provided to allow the people to know the source of the completely incorrect mapping seen in the proposed CZMPs.
 - iv. The CRZ of Goa has seen great destruction at the hands of big hotels, industries, ports & shipping, highways, etc, but none of these destructive constructions/activities are shown on the maps prepared. NCSCM has intentionally concealed this most essential information in order to make the review and consultation meaningless.
 - v. The report and maps fail to consider the new threats of climate catastrophe, sea level rise and storm surges. Sea level rise and storm surges are the biggest threat to Goa, and these plans are dangerous without mapping the hazards of these extreme events to come.
 - vi. The report does not consider the abject failure of CRZ Notifications to protect the coast of Goa, especially the fishing communities, whose houses have been mercilessly destroyed in the past by misusing the law, while large scale destruction and constructions contrary to the objectives of the law have been permitted.
 - vii. The report fails to give any reasoned management plan for the protection of the coast. The plans are prepared only to facilitate projects of corporations to make short term profits, at huge costs to the local economies and communities
- g) The gram sabha members further discussed that it is impossible for effective participation by the local communities and others during the Public Hearing scheduled on 7th July 2019 as the information provided to the local authorities and on websites is only in English and is inaccessible to the fishing communities and other indigenous communities, since no local languages are used. All information must be available in Konkani (both Romi and Devnagri) and Marathi. The Gram Sabha Members further discussed the following pointwise.
- i. The fisher folk live under great stress due to the severe problems faced due to past destruction of their environment and fisheries due to industrial activities, forcing them to work like daily labourers for their survival. It is impossible for them to participate in the Hearing proposed to be held at only one place in each District of Goa due to the distances involved and time constraints. No meaningful participation is possible, unless the fishing communities can attend the hearings, and therefore the hearings and consultations must be held in each village, preferably at Gram Sabha meetings.

- ii. Both the venues are at a significant distance from coastal villages of Goa. As recorded by the order of High Court of Madras in WP 11081 of 2010, the TNPCB was ordered to arrange for transport facility for people from all affected villages to be able to attend the public hearing. However, in the present case, due to the number of persons involved, even if such transportation was made available, it is impossible to hear tens of thousands of persons without holding hearings at each village, or as agreed by the Gram Sabhas.
- iii. At each of the locations, the public hearing is scheduled to last for only 9 hours. We find it impossible to believe that concerned people from each village will be given sufficient time to place their objections in front of the concerned authority when in the North, 103 village maps have to be scrutinized and in the South 70 village maps have to be scrutinized. This is without even including the 1:25000 scape maps which also need to be scrutinized.
- iv. Public hearing for both North and South Goa have been scheduled on the same day. Many stakeholders, both individuals and associations, must participate in both districts, as they have fishing, scientific, environmental, social or other interests in CRZ areas in both the districts. It will be impossible for such persons and associations to participate in both hearings, rendering both the hearings a failure.
- v. The designated venues, Talegaon community hall, Caranzalem and Ravindra Bhavan, Margao do not have the capacity to accommodate all the traditional fisherfolk from 103 fishing villages from North districts, and 70 fishing villages from South district, respectively. Apart from fisherfolk, hundreds of other citizens will also be present, and these venues are not equipped to enable meaningful participation by such large numbers of active participants.
- vi. The CZMPs and public consultation proposed are both in gross violation of the laws of the land, including the EPA, CRZ Notification 2011, Court Orders and other laws protecting the environment and the citizens' rights.
- vii. The CZMPs and public consultation proposed are both in gross violation of Articles 14, 19, 21, 243 of the Constitution of India, and of other provisions for the protection of the rights of the scheduled tribes and environment.

After prolonged discussion the Gram Sabha Members unanimously resolved that the CZMPs prepared by NCSCM without consulting the

indigenous communities who own the coasts of Goa are totally illegitimate in view of Article 243 of our Constitution and section 5, (ii) of the CRZ Notification, 2011 must be rejected completely and fresh CZMPs must be prepared in consultation with the indigenous communities of Goa.

It is further resolved to reject the public hearing scheduled on 7th July 2019 and that the NIO or Goa University must prepare the revised draft plans, in consultation with the Local Communities, panchayats and associations of fisher folk, tenants and other local stakeholders, before holding the public hearing. It is further resolved to forward this resolution to the Member Secretary, Goa Coastal Zone Management Authority and to the other Concerned Authorities to take all necessary steps to preserve the rights of the villagers over the lands and water bodies in the CRZ within the Panchayat area by ensuring that the CZMPs are prepared correctly as per the actual facts and the aspirations of the people.

2. To discuss regarding measure on water conservation.

Eleuterio Carneiro	Proposer
All Gram Sabha Members	Seconder

The Sarpanch placed the letter 01/07/2019 as informed earlier in this meeting which is received as per letter from Hon'ble Prime Minister of India to take up rain water conservation activities on priority. She informed that Water Conservation is an integral part of Indian identity and cultural history. That in India, water conservation in the form of rainwater harvesting is an ancient tradition which has become more relevant in present day scenario. Also, the issue of water conservation is not just about "saving" water, it is about having enough clean water at any given time and place to meet our needs and the conservation of our water resources depends on our wise use of these resources. She further brought to the notice of the Gram Sabha Members that several efforts have been made in India and other parts of world wherever water shortage has become an important issue. Various Government Departments have undertaken construction of water harvesting structures which has not only helped in storing water on surface but also enhanced recharge to ground water. The challenge can be effectively met by taking up programmes of artificial recharge to ground water in a big way throughout the country. The Ministry of Water Resources, Government of India has taken various initiatives for promoting Artificial Recharge and Rain water harvesting including preparation of a conceptual Master Plan for Artificial Recharge to Ground Water in India. Water conservation depends on our wise use of these resources. Such wise use, without a doubt, begins at home and in

our community. Although rainwater harvesting continues to be practiced globally, and there is renewed interest in its revival, the system nonetheless has fallen to disrepair. Further, she informed that measures for water conservation has to be streamlined to promote rainwater harvesting as the water resources are fast depleting due to rapid increase in population and unrestricted use of water as due to over exploitation of water resources, it has become scarce. State Government have undertaken various programs in water conservation and management. She requested the Gram Sabha members to make every effort to improve the village ground water level by collecting & conserving even a single drop of water. Further the Gram Sabha member and Convenor to the Village Development Committee Shri. Eleuterio Carneiro suggested that the said matter be placed for the Village Development Committee Meeting, where-in the members of the committee could verify the existing ponds, tanks, lakes for maintenance of the same so as to make ground water level stable. After-which the VDC shall submit the same to the Panchayat to adopt necessary resolution in the matter. After discussion the Sarpanch accepted the said proposal and requested that the matter be taken up by the Village Development Committee on a priority basis and to act on the same.

Member Smt. Adelina Fernandes extended vote of thanks to the Gram Sabha Members for their presence and active participation in the discussion. Further, the Sarpanch informed that the above suggestions shall be forwarded to the Concerned Authorities for action and the meeting ended at 05.40 p.m.

Recorded by:

(Joaquim Rodrigues)
Secretary, V.P. Navelim.

(Vilma D'Silva)
Sarpanch, V.P. Navelim.